

DECISION ITEM

REPORT OF	MEETING	DATE	ITEM NO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTORATE	PLANNING COMMITTEE	13 JUNE 2018	8
LOCAL LIST OF HERITAGE ASSETS – APPEAL AGAINST ADDITION OF A PROPERTY TO THE LIST			

PUBLIC ITEM

This item is for consideration in the public part of the meeting.

SUMMARY

An appeal has been received against adding a property to the Local List: St Thomas School, St Thomas Road, St Annes.

St Thomas School Trustees criticised the photograph on the datasheet that showed the historic part of the school as it did not indicate that the historic part was only a small part in a large modern school of low architectural merit. The argument made is that the Expert Panellists could have made their decision without a full appreciation of the total building as it stands today.

The property was taken to an appeal panel for consideration. The appeal panellists comprise the NW representation of IHBC (Crispin Edwards), the conservation officer at Rossendale Borough Council (Sebastian Pickles) and architect at Croft Goode Partnership (Mick Goode). The panellists met on 21st March to consider the heritage merits of the assets and to recommend the asset is either added to the local list or is not added to the local list. Their report is below.

Committee is requested to consider the report and add the asset to the Local List.

RECOMMENDATION

St Thomas School is added to the Local List of Heritage Assets

SUMMARY OF PREVIOUS DECISIONS

The asset has not been included on a Local List committee meeting agenda previously.

CORPORATE PRIORITIES

Spending your money in the most efficient way to achieve excellent services (Value for Money)	✓
Delivering the services that customers expect of an excellent council (Clean and Green)	✓
Working with all partners (Vibrant Economy)	✓
To make sure Fylde continues to be one of the most desirable places to live (A Great Place to Live)	✓
Promoting Fylde as a great destination to visit (A Great Place to Visit)	✓

REPORT

The school is situated on St. Thomas Road, St. Annes and is relatively low lying. The school was put forward for local listing and was recommended by the Expert Panel.

The School formally objected to the proposed local listing status drawing attention to the fact that the original school had been extended significantly. As such it was considered that these extensions and alterations had devalued the original building, thereby reducing its value and a heritage asset worthy of conservation.

The appeal was accepted on the basis that the architectural quality and integrity of the building was challenged. As a result, and in accordance with the Local Listing Protocol an independent Appeal Panel was arranged and the matter considered.

The appeal panel met on 21st March 2018 and discussed the architectural merit and historic merit of the asset using the Local Listing Protocol document, the datasheet, photographs, and OS map provided. The panel did not discuss the significance of the asset with the Council staff at any stage so as to maintain impartiality.

Summary of Asset: Overall significance and setting

The Panel noted that the design of the original school building is similar to the adjacent golf club buildings and it thus had group value with these. Although the extensions have had a visual impact on the original school, a point made by the appellants, it was nonetheless considered that the original building the original part has not been altered. It remained 'intact' and continues to contribute to the street scene. Indeed the modern extensions could be said to highlight the detailed architectural presence and style of the historic building perhaps providing the passer-by with an appreciation of the original pleasing historic building and also note its group value with the Golf Club buildings.

Comment on historic and architectural significance

Noted as a well-designed, attractive and little-altered Edwardian school which illustrates the growth of the town and provision of facilities by the Clifton estate

Selection Criteria applied

Age, architectural merit, historic interest, group value and setting.

- As a building of 1905, the school does not require the exceptional features for post-1939 buildings.

Architectural interest:

- The C17 Revival style is not thought to be particularly resonant with the period for St Annes but was a popular choice for buildings of this type and scale at the time.
- The school has uniqueness in the context of the town as a small school building.
- The school retains substantial integrity, the original form still being largely unaltered and readable; extensions are low and do not intrude substantially on the elevations, from a distance reading as potentially detached. Even on the E elevation where the extension comes forward of the midline, the upper portion of the window is readable. The replacement of the windows in uPVC is regrettable but the pattern is appropriate for the style and probably replicates the original wooden windows.
- features of interest include the palette of natural materials, shaped (Flemish) gables with kneelers, roof ventilator, stone and brick bands, blocks and hood moulds to the arched window heads, stone sill band and other dressings, use of contrasting colours in a way that reflects the Fylde tradition of cobble-galleted walls, date stone with scroll supports, windows breaking the eaves line, and buttresses.

Historic interest:

- This is felt to derive from the way in which the school, paired with the church, illustrates the growth and development of the town and provision of facilities by the Clifton estate. The description could tease this out better.
- Schools also often have strong resonance with local people who attended or had friends who did so.

Group Value:

- The school forms a harmonious visual group with the nearby golf club buildings which are in similar revival styles and have a similar palette of materials, the three buildings being viewed together from several vantage points.

Setting:

- The way in which the school is set back from the road and is visible in long views from the east, and elevated views from the railway bridge to the west, contributes to its architectural interest.
- The low height of extensions and the large amount of open space around the school and golf club buildings, particularly between the road and the building line of the school, also contributes to this and the group value.

Response to submitted Grounds of Appeal

We considered the additions and the extent to which these impact on the interest of the building as part of our discussion, and concluded that the three elevations which can be seen from the street have not been unduly affected, and we do not believe that the impact on the rear elevation would be sufficient to render the building no longer of local interest; we confirmed that the entry should be confined to the original building though.

We note that the building is not mentioned in the Pevsner volume, but in itself this does not mean that it is of no interest. The other matters raised in the letter do not relate to the criteria, but to the implications of local listing, which is not for us to consider.

Conclusion

The school meets several of the selection criteria for inclusion on the Local List, although the entry could be enhanced to slightly better elucidate the historic interest, group value and setting. It is recommended that the building be added to the Local List.

IMPLICATIONS	
Finance	There are no financial implications arising directly from this report.
Legal	none
Community Safety	none
Human Rights and Equalities	none
Sustainability and Environmental Impact	none
Health & Safety and Risk Management	none

LEAD AUTHOR	CONTACT DETAILS	DATE
Paul Drinnan	pauld@fylde.gov.uk 01253 658434	29/5/18

BACKGROUND PAPERS		
Name of document	Date	Where available for inspection
Appeal panel report	28/3/18	Regeneration office, Town Hall

Attached documents

1. Datasheet for the asset